

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft

ESA ITT AO/1-8620/16/NL/LF

Pierre Sarrailh (project manager) Sebastien Hess (WPs leader) Alessandro Retino (WPs leader) version 1 of Oct. 23rd, 2017

ONERA

THE FRENCH AEROSPACE LAB

return on innovation



SPIS Status



THE FRENCH AEROSPACE LAB

return on innovation

What is SPIS ?

- Spacecraft Plasma Interaction Software includes physics
 - 3D and dynamical modelling of the surrounding plasma sheath;
 - Particles and current collections;
 - Surface effects and secondary emissions;
 - Internal electrical balance;
 - Active sources.

SPIS architecture is

- Based on a numerical kernel, SPIS-NUM, an electrostatic 3D unstructured electrostatic Particle-In-Cell plasma model ;
- Fully developed on a Java-based highly modular Object Oriented library
- Include a complete Integrated Modelling Environment (IME), SPIS-UI:
 - Pre-processing (CAD, meshing, IBCs settings, simulation settings...)
 - Simulation control and monitoring;
 - Data-mining and post-processing.

SPIS software → open-source project

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017

SPIS quick overview



ONERA

Historical context

SPIS

- Initiated in 2001 by ESA, with support of several national agencies (CNES)
- About 10 major releases since 2003
- More than 8 500 downloads (all versions/branches included)
- More than 1 300 downloads for SPIS 5.1.9
- Open to various fields: ESD, instrument calibration, propulsion, dusty plasmas, internal charging.
- Various contributions:
 - SPIS-GEO
 - SPIS-Science
 - AISEPS
 - SPIS-Dust
 - SPIS-IC (To be released)
 - Components mutualised with other scientific communities

SPINE, an active community

- http://dev.spis.org
- More than 900 registered members (and around 2 new registrations a week)
- About 20 active contributors (including SMEs, major industrial actors and academics)
- Regular SPINE meetings
- Numerous publications (10+ at next SCTC



.

Last community version

- SPIS 5.2
 - Major contribution from ESTEC contract on Dusty plasma (F. Cipriani)
 - Of course, totally different physics is included : dust grain charging, surface contamination, lunar environments
 - Improved solvers : robust particle pusher, stabilized circuit solver (even though still improvable)
 - New UI capabilities
 - Experimental validation by PhD student A. Champlain started in 2013
 - 2 publications in scientific journals

For users that are not interested by dusts:

The new capabilities **do not complicate the use of SPIS** *if you do not need it, you probably will not even see it* The **efficiency of SPIS for non-dusty simulations is not impacted** *memory usage is smaller and execution speed increased by* ~10%

of Version addresses in

SPIS 5.2 available on SPIS website

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017

What SPIS is good at

- SC charging in GEO
 - From ESTEC/ESA contract finished in 2013 (D. Rodgers) and from initial contracts (ESA/CNES)
 - Simplified use for industry \rightarrow SPIS 5 version
 - 10+ publications in scientific journals : comparison with NASCAP, LANL spacecraft data, electron emitter assessment, ...
 - Scientific missions dealing with low energy plasma measurements
 - From ESTEC/ESA contract finished in 2014 (A. Hilgers)
 - Lots of scientific tools \rightarrow SPIS 5.1.8 version (last available)
 - 5+ publications in scientific journals: LEO Cubesat charging, Solar orbiter, Juice, ...

Ground plasma tank

- Detailed characteristics of plasma chambers and particles sources (ion and electron guns) and instruments (LP, RPA, KP)
- 5+ publications in scientific journals: electrodynamic tether, secondary electron emission yield, surface potential ...



What SPIS can be quite good at

- Plasma thrusters interaction with spacecraft (charging, efficiency, erosion, contamination)
 - From ESTEC contract finished in 2012 (E. Gengembre) lead by Airbus DS
 - Database of thrusters available on demand at ESA
 - Updated model for electron cooling, Charge exchange reaction
 - Included in SPIS 5 but miss important physics however \rightarrow SPIS-EP project
 - A few papers in scientific journals
- Thin elements
 - SPIS includes models for thin wires and thin panels (electric field and particle collection)
 - Assume long Debye length regime to obtain analytical fits
- Quick overview of capabilities is now difficult to do \rightarrow look at the html user guide



Candidate contributions for the next official distribution

- Electric propulsion related projects
- ESA funded activities (started in 2016)
 - 1. Electron Cooling model (ESA TO K. Dannemayer)
 - Airbus DS, ONERA, UC3M, ICARE, KTH
 - · Advanced hybrid models & plume measurements
 - 2. SPIS-EP (ESA TO F. Cipriani)
 - ONERA, Artenum, Airbus DS, TAS
 - UR gathered from ESA and from the 22nd SPINE community (March 23-24, 2016)
 - Aspects covered: cathode current, multiple thrusters, distributions of ions, plasma interaction with the power units, interconnects, chemistry, erosion, contamination, dedicated outputs, ...
 - 3. High Power High Voltage (ESA TO G. D'accolti)
 - Airbus DS, ONERA
 - Plasma current collection on high voltage solar arrays

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017

Possible future contributions (not mature)

- Ongoing work from PhD at Onera:
 - Patch method (A. Brunet Onera/CNES PhD started 2014):
 - Advanced multi-domain method allowing to refine the mesh on particular locations ("patch").
 - Small-scale systems simulation: SC interconnectors, sensors
 - Large-scale simulations: thruster plume, wake. . .
 - Hybrid method (O. Jorba-Ferro Onera/CNES PhD / LATMOS started 2015):
 - Coupled fluid and perturbative-PIC method allowing the simulation of dense plasma flows
 - First targets are the MYRIADE spacecraft (TARANIS)

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017



Project presentation



THE FRENCH AEROSPACE LAB

return on innovation

Overview

• Project:

- ESA ITT AO/1-8620/16/NL/LF "Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft"
- ESA/ESTEC TO: Fabrice Cipriani
- Consortium: Onera, Artenum, LPP (+ IRF)

Scope

- ASPOC systems used to control and stabilize the spacecraft surface potential in interplanetary plasma:
 - Improvement of the electrostatic cleanliness of the SC to be able to particle and field measurement
 - But introduce others plasma perturbation due to the ion beam
- SPIS mainly able to model the electrostatic cleanliness of the SC without ion emitter (essentially an outcome of the SPIS-SCIENCE project)
- Effect of the ion emitter(s) on the low energy particle detector and electric field measurement difficult or partially reachable with the present version of SPIS

ONERA

and Version addresses in

Overview

- Objectives
 - Better describe in SPIS the space charge effects of the ion beam on the space environment plasma and on the onboard instruments for the low energy plasma measurements
 - Improvement of the physical model and the numerical methods used in SPIS and make it available to the scientific community
 - Validate the developed model in relevant cases for THOR mission

Method

- Define the modeling requirements wrt ion beam effect to the low energy plasma measurements
- Assess the current SPIS limitation and define development requirements
- Develop a new version of SPIS
- Validate the new software wrt Cluster data
- Create a SPIS model of THOR spacecraft

Study logic



WP 100 : Analysis of current limitations and User **Requirements** Definition

- Overall objectives :
 - Define the ion beam effect on low energy plasma modelling requirements
 - Assess the limitation of the current SPIS version wrt the modelling requirements

Overall approach for each sub-task

- Sub-task 110 : User Requirements definition
 - Define User requirements for the developments of SPIS
 - Survey targeting the SPIS user community
- Sub-task 120 : SPIS limitations assessment
 - Assess the limitations of SPIS for the accurate physical representation of the electrostatic environment of an ion emitting spacecraft
 - Define performance needs for typical targets of the new SPIS functionalities



WP 200 : Review of models and Numerical methods, Definition of Software Requirements and Architecture Design

- Overall objectives :
 - Review the existing physical and numerical models improvement to perform
 - Establish the corresponding Software Requirements and a software Architecture Design
 - Define new algorithms to describe the physical processes to implement in SPIS

Overall approach for each sub-task

- Sub-task 210 : SPIS NUM model definition and SR analysis
 - Define new models for SPIS that meet the needs defined in TN1 and URD
 - Determine the software requirements for the numerical core of SPIS
- Sub-task 220 : SPIS UI SR analysis
 - Determine the software requirements for the user interface of SPIS
- Sub-task 230 : Software Requirement and Architecture Definition
 - Define the software requirements for SPIS
 - Define the architecture of SPIS



WP 300 : Coding of algorithms, new models implementation and verification

- Overall objectives :
 - · Perform the developments, update the user manual and perform verification tests

Overall approach for each sub-task

- Sub-task 310 : SPIS NUM developments
 - Perform the development of the numerical core of SPIS, except the electromagnetic field solver
- Sub-task 320 : SPIS UI developments
 - Perform the development of the user interface of SPIS
- Sub-task 330 : EM solver developments
 - · Perform the development of the electromagnetic field solver
- Sub-task 340 : SPIS functional test
 - Perform the software functional test and verification
- Sub-task 350 : SPIS documentation
 - Update the SPIS user manual

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017

WP 400 : End to End Validation of the ion emitting spacecraft model and related effects

- Overall objectives :
 - Validated the ion beam effect model by using a wide range of environments parameters, beam currents and photoemission currents
 - · Compare beam potential to experimental / flight data

Overall approach for each sub-task

- Sub-task 410 : Cluster data assessment and validation planning
 - Provide expertise on Cluster data to help define the most interesting cases for the validation
 - Participate to the validation plan definition
 - Provide a hands-on formation to SPIS to the validation team
 - Build a mock-up simulation of Cluster to serve as a basis for the validation simulations
- Sub-task 420 : Validation tests
 - Definition of the draft validation test plan approved at the PM2.
 - End-to-end validation testing performed according to the updated validation test plan approved by the Agency.
 - Validation test projects and the specified outputs shall be delivered



Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017

WP 500 : Software consolidation and (THOR model) delivery

Overall objectives :

• Consolidate the developed SPIS software based on the outcomes from the validation phase.

Overall approach for each sub-task

- Sub-task 510 : Documentation update
 - · Update the SPIS documentation after validation phase
- Sub-task 520 : SPIS update
 - · Update of the SPIS software following the results of the validation phase
- Sub-task 530 : SPIS packaging
 - Perform packaging of SPIS
- Sub-task 440 : THOR modelling
 - Provide instrument geometry
 - · Provide a THOR mock-up simulation, including configurable geometry

Schedule



test Verteine additioners the



Modelling proposal



THE FRENCH AEROSPACE LAB

return on innovation

Modelling requirements (preliminary)

SR #	Title	Description		
SR-DL-01	ASPOC definition	It shall be possible to define a surface group as an ASPOC and to define its characteristics		
SR-DL-02	ASPOC species definition	It shall be possible to associate species to the ASPOC and to define their types and distributions.		
SR-DL-03	Instrument definition	It shall be possible to define a surface group as ar instrument site and to define the instrument characteristics		
SR-DL-04	Instrument geometry definition	It shall be possible to define the geometry of the instrument with the precision required for an accurate measurement simulation. The mesh refinement around the instrument shall be handled automatically by the software.		
SR-DL-05	Near field description	It shall be possible to use the automated mesh refinement to model the near field region at the exit of the ASPOC.		



Modelling requirements (preliminary)

SR #	Title	Description				
SR-SL-01	ASPOC particle emission	The emission of particles from the ASPOC shall be simulated in accordance with the parameters defined in SR-DL-02.				
SR-SL-02	Motion in magnetic field	The accuracy and performance of the particle pusher including the magnetic field shall allow for accurate simulations of the spacecraft interaction with the environment and ASPOC plume in reasonable simulation durations.				
SR-SL-03	Low statistical noise	The environment and emitted populations shall be described using a low statistical noise algorithm, still preserving the accuracy of the distribution modelling.				
SR-SL-04	Thin wire approximation in targeted environments	It shall be possible to simulate thin wires using the thin wire approximation in all the environments that the THOR mission may encounter.				
SR-SL-05	Thin wire ends	The potential at the end of thin wires shall be accurately modelled to allow the simulation of measurements made by probes at the end of the wires.				
SR-SL-06	Coupling with waves	The stability and behaviour of SPIS shall allow to simulate transient phenomena, in particular the coupling with waves				
SR-SL-07	Plasma waves in magnetized environment	The plasma waves arising from the plasma coupling with the electromagnetic field shall be modelled.				
SR-SL-08	Spinning spacecraft	The moderately high spin rate of the spacecraft shall be taken into account, not only by rotating the boundary conditions (as already exists in SPIS), but also the background magnetic field and the particles in the simulation domain.				
SR-SL-09	Refined mesh	The numerical core of SPIS shall handle the presence of refined meshes that will be used for improving the accuracy of the instrument outputs and near field trajectories only (no self consistent calculation over the refined mesh).				

Modelling requirements (preliminary)

SR #	Title	Description
SR-OL-01	CDF outputs	The relevant instrument outputs shall be exportable in the CDF format to ease comparison with observational data.
SR-OL-02	Dynamic spectra	Field measurements shall be presented as dynamic spectra.
SR-OL-03	Visualization of quantities along the thin wires	The quantities that are computed by SPIS (datafields) shall be viewable as plots in the data mining section.

SPIS-EP Status

SPIS-EP software version dedicated to plume interaction with spacecraft:

- · Current on the spacecraft that induced charging effects
- Current collection on solar arrays that produces power losses
- High energy ions (> 20 eV) that produces erosion
- · Contamination by the erosion products
- Differential charging that produces ESD
- Coupling of the plasma plume with the plasma environment
- Coupling between plume in case of multiple thrusters
- Cathode/neutralizer behavior
- Electric coupling of the thrusters with respect to the spacecraft (differential potential CRP)
- Validation is on-going
- Final version beginning of 2018



Plume modelling

- · Plasma models:
 - PIC for ions: source (Xe+ and Xe++), CEX ions and environment ions (H+ or O+)
 - Fluid/analytical electron distribution
 - Maxwell-Boltzmann for ambient plasma (LEO / MEO)
 - Polytropic or adiabatic or isothermal law for electrons from thruster/cathode block
 - Electron populations implicitly solved in Poisson equation
 - Charge exchange collisions in volume
- Surface interactions model:
 - Current collection \rightarrow Implicit circuit solver (linear predictors of plasma current)
 - High voltage solar arrays interconnects (reduced analytical laws)
 - Erosion and contamination
- Thruster system block model:
 - Cathode floating potential model
 - Electric coupling with SC → floating, grounded or decoupling resistor
 - Current balance with environment plasma

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017

Models of plume / ion sources

Legacy Maxwellian Thruster

Defines a thruster with a Maxwellian distribution using already existing surface distribution (Axisymetric tabulated and AISEPS also possible)

Maxwellian Thruster

Defines a thruster with a Maxwellian distribution using the generic thruster distribution

Maxwellian Thruster 1D

Defines a thruster with a Maxwellian distribution using a 1D energy distribution

Generic Thruster

Defines a thruster with a Maxwellian distribution using a 1D energy distribution and a 2D energy-angle distribution

SPT100

Defines a SPT100 thruster

Models of plume / ion sources







2D:

Electron cooling model implementation: Quasi – neutral approximation at global scale

- In the quasi neutral approximation
 - $n_e = n_i$

•As there is no net charge the electric potential only exists to balance the thermal pressure forces

• $n_e \operatorname{grad} V = \operatorname{grad} n_e T_e$

•This is a major drawback of the method as not all potential are possible in this model. In particular highly negative potentials due to polarized conductors would lead to negative temperature and cannot be modelled.

•Usually, the electron temperature is set as a function of the electron density, but because of neutrality, it can also be expressed as a function f of the ion density. This temperature is assumed to have a smooth spatial variation:

$$T_e = f_{smoothed}(n_i)$$

•The function *f* must be monotonic and continuous so we can compute the quasi-neutral electron density as:

•
$$n_{e,qn} = f^{-1}(T_e) \sim n_i$$

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017

Electron cooling model implementation: Isothermal Poisson-Boltzmann approximation at local scale

•The electron density may not be equal to the ion density locally:

•
$$n_e = n_{e,qn} + \delta n_e$$

Solving Poisson equation:

•
$$e(n_e - n_{e,qn})/\varepsilon_0 = \Delta V \sim (V - V_{qn})/\lambda_D^2$$

• $n_e/n_{e,qn} = 1 + (n_e/n_{e,qn})e(V-V_{qn})/kT_e$

$$n_e = n_{e,qn} \exp[e(V - V_{qn})/kT_e]$$

In this model, $n_{e,qn}$, V_{qn} and T_e are function of the ion density, not of the local electron density, so that the mathematical form of the above equation is exactly the same as that of the usual Maxwell-Boltzmann distribution, except is local and not global.

•Contrary to the quasi-neutral case, the Poisson equation is solved explicitly (even if the electron density contribution to the Poisson equation can be implicited). It is possible to simulate non-neutral sheaths close to polarized surfaces.



SPIS models electrons like a neutralizing background with an electrostatic perturbation: n~n₀ exp(-q(V-V_{ref})/kT) No kinetic effects, impossible to differentiate electron population on their origin

SPIS – EP assumes quasi-neutrality between the cathode electrons and the ions of the plume they neutralize (incl. CEX) with an electrostatic perturbation:

 $n \sim n_i \exp(-q(V - V_{quasi-neutral} - V_{cathode})/kT)$

Kinetic effect taken into account via the ion density. Possible to differentiate electron population from different origins.

Possible to model cathode imbalance by exchanging parts of the plume to neutralize between cathodes.

The electrons are isothermal for small densities.

$$J_{\infty} = J_{boundary} \sqrt{1 - \frac{\min(q\tilde{V}, 0)}{T_{boundary}}} exp\left(-\frac{\max(q\tilde{V}, 0)}{T_{boundary}}\right)$$
$$\tilde{V} = V_{boundary} - V_{qn;boundary} + V_{qn;\infty}$$

Simulation of a floating SC in a cold plasma environment now possible

Modelling of Electrostatic Environment of Ion Emitting Spacecraft, 23rd Oct. 2017









































ONERA

test Verselve additionally pass





Availability: contractual terms

Because it exist no official way to contribute to the community version directly:

SPIS-EP will be made public but not delivered as an official version

Any SPIS-CORE development must be reversed automatically to the public version

All specific developments will be gathered in a SPIS-NUM plugin that will be public

Context

SPIS shall be developed to better handle scientific probes dedicated to precise plasma measurements that use active Spacecraft Potential Control (ASPOC) systems.

New difficulties, new capabilities:

- precise scientific measurements. Require low noise ($d\phi \ll kT$) simulations
- magnetized natural plasma perturbed by dense plasma jets + waves. Magnetic field perturbation shall be modeled.
- new kind of data to compare with observations, that must be handled by existing softwares.
- spinning spacecraft.



of Version addresses in

Context

SPIS shall be developed to better handle scientific probes dedicated to precise plasma measurements that use active Spacecraft Potential Control (ASPOC) systems.

New difficulties, new capabilities:

- precise scientific measurements. Require low noise ($d\varphi \ll kT$) simulations

 \Rightarrow Use the LEO package

magnetized natural plasma perturbed by dense plasma jets + waves.
 Magnetic field perturbation shall be modeled.

 \Rightarrow Develop a generalized Ohm law algorithm

- new kind of data to compare with observations, that must be handled by existing softwares.

 \Rightarrow Make ISTP/IACG compliant cdf outputs for instruments

- spinning spacecraft.

 \Rightarrow Rotate boundaries + droplets + B and vxB fields



LEO package

Developed by Oriol Jorba-Ferro for the TARANIS mission ONERA-CNES PhD under the supervision of E. Seran (LATMOS, ISPL/CNRS)

Suite of methods that implement new fluid and PIC-perturbative methods in SPIS Gathered in a SPIS-EP extension module.

$$f(t) = f_0(t) \cdot \int_0^V \frac{\partial f_0}{\partial V} dV + \sum_{PIC=0}^N w_i(t) S(x - x_i(t))$$

 $\int_{1}^{\frac{\pi}{2}} f_0$ being any fluid distribution: (Drifting)Maxwell-Boltmann,... Depending on the distribution, f_0 may be updated from PIC.

Allow to reach very low noise levels with reasonable numerical costs

Needed to model the ASPOC impact as only particles with energy \leq few kT impacted

LEO package

PIC

Poisson-Boltzmann

Drifting Boltzmann







Running time:18h mins.





LEO package

PIC

Poisson-Boltzmann

Drifting Boltzmann







Running time:18h mins.

3 mins.



Generalized Ohm law

Natural plasma: drifting/spacecraft and magnetized, requires noisy PIC modelling But ASPOC: relatively dense plasma source, need fluid electrons

If fluid electrons, Maxwell equations more complicated. Use of Generalized Ohm Law for low frequency EM term:

 $\begin{aligned} d_t m v_e &= -\nabla P & -eE & -ev_e \times B \\ \hline \text{Inertia} & \text{Pressure} & \text{Electric} & \text{Lorentz} \\ E_{em} &= \frac{J \times B}{en_i} - \frac{J_i \times B}{en_i} - \frac{\nabla P}{en_i} = \frac{(\nabla \times B) \times B}{en_i} - \frac{J_i \times B}{en_i} - \frac{\nabla \rho_i k T_e}{en_i} \\ \hline \text{implicit electron current} & \text{and no high frequency EM waves } (d_t E \sim 0) \\ E &= E_{em} + E_{es} = \frac{(\nabla \times B) \times B}{en_i} - \frac{J_i \times B}{en_i} - \frac{\nabla \rho_i k T_e}{en_i} - \nabla \varphi \\ \hline \text{reintroduce inertia for electrostatic purpose via charge separation} \\ d_t B &= -\nabla \times E \end{aligned}$

Known to be efficient and stable for structured cartesian meshes, to be developed for unstructured tetrahedral meshes

Plasma-spacecraft-wave coupling

Use of hybrid modelling prevents from capturing all the physics. Depending on the electron modelling scheme waves that can be modeled are

Mode name	Full PIC	Fluid e-	δ f e-
Light	Х	Х	Х
Electrostatic electron waves	\checkmark	Х	?
Electromagnetic electron waves	Х	Х	Х
Electromagnetic Ion waves	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark
Electrostatic ion waves	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark



Scientific instrument outputs

Formats of scientific instrument outputs have been standardized for a long time (need for long term archiving and efficient databases)

Generally, in the space physics field recommendation is to use CDF format following the ISTP/IACG recommendations for archiving and PDS or SPASE metadata format for databases (may describe observational data as well as simulated data)

Several high level tools have been developed to handle these data.

Oct. 2017



In order to ease comparison between simulations and "real" data, we propose that numerical instruments that simulate the scientific payload save their outputs in the CDF – ISTP/IACG format.

BTW: THOR team will use tools compliant with this format.

Unmeshed elements – Thin wires/Thin Panels



- 1D → thin wires
 (booms, antena, ...)
- when $r \ll \Delta x$
- 2D → thin panels (solar panels, ...)
 when h << Δx
- One or two dimensions <u>not</u> <u>meshed</u> (repectively radius and thickness)
- but take into account:
 - Potential calculation (wire singularity or panel edges singularuty)
 - Current collection (wire radius)
 - Curent emission (surface area, impiging angle for SEE, ...)





Unmeshed elements – Thin wires/Thin Panels



- · Potential map:
 - Smooth potential jump → good description of the potential barrier
 - Potential effect of the wire
- · Emission and collection:
 - On the wire \rightarrow small effect because small radius
 - On the thin panel → standard surface (face A dielectric and face B conductor)
- · Shading effect of the SC on the wire
- Wire \rightarrow intensivelly used in the validation cases







Instrument/wire mesh refinement

In the optic of improving the instrument modelling, it is proposed to automatically generate a thinner mesh around instruments and wires. The potential is computed on this mesh by solving Poisson equation, but using coarse's mesh densities for PIC populations (thus no problem of statistics). Then, thin-wire's field would be meshed for PIC motion purposes and the end of boom problem would be solved. It would also allow to solve the wire connection to surface problem (both arose from the previously employed method).



